



EXPEDIENTE: 201900000140

**MEMORANDUM OF THE JURY OF THE RICHARD H. DRIEHAUS JURY-BASED
DESIGN COMPETITION 2019-2020.**

CHAIRPERSON:

D. Francisco Javier Marín Ramiro
General Directorate of Housing and Land

MEMBERS OF THE JURY:

Mr. José Baganha
Expert on the matter which is the aim of the
Competition

Mr. Javier Cenicacelaya
Expert designated by the Council of Architecture
Institutes of Spain

Mr. Javier Fernández Muñoz
Expert designated by the Town Council in
Santiago de Compostela. Member of the board
evaluating the proposals for Lot 3

Mr. Leopoldo Gil Cornet
Expert on the matter which is the aim of the
Competition

Mr. Enrique Salvador Guerra de Paz
Expert designated by the Town Council in Santa
Cruz de la Palma. Member of the board
evaluating the proposals for Lot 2

Mr. Léon Krier
Expert on the matter which is the aim of the
Competition

Mr. Rafael Manzano Martos
Expert on the matter which is the aim of the
Competition

Mr. Anselmo Menéndez Menéndez
Assistant Director of Housing Policies

Mr. Alejandro Pretel Avilés
Expert designated by the Town Council in
Guadix. Member of the board evaluating the
proposals for Lot 4

In Madrid, on 17 and 18 June 2020, at
16:00 the jury meets via
videoconference. The jury is made up of
the members which can be seen on the
side here, with the following agenda:

1. Procedure carried out in order to
select the proposals following the
evaluation criteria established in point
10 of the terms and conditions of the
Competition.



Mr. David Rivera

Expert on the matter which is the aim of the Competition

Ms. M^a José del Toro Oliva

Expert appointed by the Spanish Institute of Cultural Heritage within the Ministry of Culture and Sports

Mr. Miguel Vila Llopis

Expert designated by the Town Council in Alzira. Member of the board evaluating the proposals for Lot 1

Ms. Harriet Wennberg

Expert appointed by INTBAU

SECRETARY TO THE JURY:

D. Alejandro García Hermida

Executive Director of the Architecture Competition Richard H. Driehaus

The Jury has carried out the following actions:

1. All the members of the Jury have had prior access to the contents of the design proposals presented since they received the documentation directly to their email accounts via the platform wetransfer.com from the team organizing the Competition.
2. The President suggests, in accordance with point 15.3 of the terms and conditions of the Competition, giving start to the selection procedure, basing this process on a system of discussion and successive discarding, giving a score to each of the proposals according to the criteria established in the terms and conditions of the Competition.
3. In the first round, a series of proposals were discarded unanimously by the Jury, identifying them by their respective codes:

LOT 1 (ALZIRA)	LOT 2 (SC PALMA)	LOT 3 (SANTIAGO)	LOT 4 (GUADIX)
2923	3082	2874	2883
3055	3096	2909	2891
3167	3108	2926	2920
	3142	3010	2931
	3159	3011	2943
	3218	3047	3050
		3056	3101



		3071	3148
		3110 (registered with the code 3130)	3149
		3112	3151
		3124	3155
		3137	3180
		3139	3182
		3140	3188
		3154	3235
		3160	3241
		3161	3244
		3166	3251
		3169	3253
		3185	
		3193	
		3212	
		3222	
		3232	
		3237	
		3240	
		3242	
		3254	

There is an acknowledgement of the work developed in each case. However, these are considered to be those which are less close to the aims of the proposals in each case.

In a second round, a series of proposals were discarded unanimously by the Jury, identifying them by their respective codes:

LOTE 1 (ALZIRA)	LOTE 2 (SC PALMA)	LOTE 3 (SANTIAGO)	LOTE 4 (GUADIX)
2995	2887	2884	2878
2999	3025	2896	2915
3060	3028	2898	2963



3061	3069	2902	3146
3147		3123	3196
3152		3163	3252
3203		3243	

There is an acknowledgement of the fact that each of them have specific aspects which are of a positive nature and which were mentioned during the discussions. However, the verdict is that other proposals respond more adequately to the expectations as a whole of the different points of view which are searched for in each case.

Therefore, the proposals that remained as the final ones were the following:

LOTE 1 (ALZIRA)	LOTE 2 (SC PALMA)	LOTE 3 (SANTIAGO)	LOTE 4 (GUADIX)
2875	2921	2876	2899
2879	2989	2877	2903
3156	2993	3076	2913
3202	3070	3102	3165
3219	3158	3178	3206
		3238	

Among all of them, the jury specially highlighted the qualities of the following proposals:

LOTE 1 (ALZIRA)	LOTE 2 (SC PALMA)	LOTE 3 (SANTIAGO)	LOTE 4 (GUADIX)
2875	2921	2876	2899
2879	2989	2877	3165
3156	2993	3178	3206
	3158	3238	

4. The members of the Jury deliberate on the proposals, deciding, unanimously, that the prizes were to be given to these ones presented below:

PRIZES REGARDING LOT 1 (ALZIRA)

FIRST PRIZE worth 12,000€ (WINNING PROPOSAL) is granted to the proposal presented under code 3156, which stood out because of its aim to retrieve the urban fabric of the west area of "la Vila" and because of how it gives value to the vestiges of the Almohad wall and the former church of Santa María, the main heritage elements which shape this end of the urban fabric. The new



suggested streets converge in a square connected to the riverbank of the river Júcar. New businesses and facilities open towards this square, where the floor plan of the former church is enhanced. The primitive bell tower is retrieved, turned now into a viewpoint which makes it become the main landmark when one analyses the profile of the city and also the finishing element of the street which runs along its main axis. The idea of establishing this landmark was particularly praised by the jury which, however, did underline the need for the project to open more towards the river (as far as possible), a comment to be taken into consideration for the future development of the project.

Apart from that, the jury decided to award two honourable mentions to the proposals which were considered especially successful in solving some of the arisen issues.

FIRST HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€ is granted to the proposal presented under code 2879. This proposal was considered especially successful in terms of the project's relationship with the riverbanks of the river Júcar and the treatment it gives to this connection, as well as the mastery with regard to the local architectural tradition of the place shown in the way of the recomposing of the primitive blocks towards this end of "la Vila". The jury, on the other hand, did point out the need for this proposal to create larger public spaces with a greater capacity to attract life towards this area.

SECOND HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€ is granted to the proposal presented under code 2875. This proposal was praised for its suggestion to create a new volume adjacent to the riverbank, retrieving the memory of the former existing mill in that area and shaping with it, an adequate visual and architectural finishing to the stretch going from the center of "la Vila" to the area of intervention. The jury also highlighted the successful spatial delimitation of the new public space which was created within the boundaries of the area enclosed by the primitive wall. However, it was considered an excessively simplified proposal both typologically and also spatially when it came to the suggested solution for the retrieved residential blocks of buildings.

PRIZES REGARDING LOT 2 (SANTA CRUZ DE LA PALMA)

The jury decided to leave this prize (winning proposal) without it being awarded to any proposal, in accordance with the section 15.3 of the competition guidelines, since the jury believed none of the presented proposals responded in a satisfactory way to the entire set of objectives which aimed to be achieved for this location.

However, since the jury found notable qualities in several of the projects which were put forward, they decided to award an honourable mention *ex aequo* to two of them.

As a consequence, as the proposals have proven to be manifestly insufficient to satisfy, without having to carry out substantial changes, the needs and requirements set in the competition's rules and the Technical Specifications Document which apply to the present competition. Consequently, the Town Council in Santa Cruz de La Palma is suggested to carry out an unpublished negotiated procedure with the proposals awarded with an honourable mention, in accordance with article 168.a.1º Law 9/2017, dated 8 November, regarding Public Sector Contracts, so that, after negotiating the conditions of the contract of the drafting of the project, the commission is finally awarded to a team which has been legitimately elected. The jury of the competition offers its help to the Town Council of Santa Cruz de La Palma to that aim, to aid it in its decision whenever it is required.



FIRST HONOURABLE MENTION *EX AEQUO* (I), worth 2,000€ to project under code 2921, highlighting its excellent proposal for the building which would hold the museum, based on the architectural tradition of the island, but noting it did not give a quality response to the problem regarding the covering of the Barranco de las Nieves.

FIRST HONOURABLE MENTION *EX AEQUO* (II), worth 2,000€ to proposal 2989, for solving with special acuity the new urban structure for the area, articulated by an attractive boulevard which descends towards the sea, but not being considered as successful in its approach to the design of the museum, which was not considered in line with the local identity of the architecture of La Palma.

The jury also decided to award honourable mentions to two other proposals which they considered best responded to solving some of the arisen issues.

SECOND HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€ is granted to the proposal presented under code 2993. This proposal was considered especially successful in terms of the connection the project establishes with the sea front and because of how it gives value to the existing bastion. However, the jury did find problems in both its urban layout and the lack of suitability of the buildings suggested, far from the distinctive character of the architectural tradition of La Palma, and in need, because of the shapes used in their design, of structures which would require for them to be carried out by means of constructive systems completely alien to those traditional ones.

THIRD HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€ is granted to the proposal presented under code 3158. This proposal was also praised for its connection with the sea front, as well as for the suggested volume for the museum. However, the design which is presented to solve the issue of the existing exposed party wall overlooking the area of intervention as well as several aspects regarding the design of the museum were considered to be inadequate. Once again, these designs would inevitably require the use of structures which would have to be carried out by means of constructive systems completely alien to those traditional ones.

Given there was no agreement among the jury members on the proposals to be awarded for this lot, it was decided by the majority of the jury to award the aforementioned proposals. Leon Krier resigned from the jury for being in disagreement with this decision.

PRIZES REGARDING LOT 3 (SANTIAGO DE COMPOSTELA)

FIRST PRIZE worth 12,000€ (WINNING PROPOSAL) is granted to the proposal presented under code 2877. The jury highlighted its way carry out the rehabilitation of the series of constructions which are in a state of ruin at present, to turn them into dwellings for artists, retrieving their original shapes and traditional constructive techniques, as well as because of the subtle connection in two different levels of the Rúa da Caramoniña with what today is the park of Santo Domingo de Bonaval. This proposal shows a unique ability to respond to the several challenges this area presented without leaving to one side the need to preserve and enhance, at the same time, the most attractive aspects it still maintains today.

The jury also decided to award honourable mentions to two other proposals which they considered best responded to solving some of the arisen issues.



FIRST HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€ is granted to the proposal presented under code 3238. The jury finds it possesses very similar characteristics to those seen in the winning proposal, with a careful treatment of both the rehabilitated constructions and the connection with the neighbouring park, also linked to it from two points, a physical one which enables an actual access to it, and the other one which establishes a visual connection to it. It was considered, however, that there was an excessive emphasis on the access to the suggested residence, carried out by means of a solution which differs widely from the tradition of the place. The proposal also raised doubts with regard to the adequacy of leaving to this aim one of the buildings in a state of ruin instead of carrying out its rehabilitation.

SECOND HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€ is granted to the proposal presented under code 2876, which was also praised for the mastery of the traditional forms and materials it shows and because of how it gives value and ensures the preservation of the area of intervention. Their commitment to solving the existing problems in the access to the *Rua de Caramoniña* from the *Rua de Ramón Valle Inclán* was also notable, even if part of it was considered to be difficult to make compatible with its current use. In contrast, it was also noted that the suggested treatment for the area of the actual *Rua da Caramoniña* might excessively alter its present character.

THIRD HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€ is granted to the proposal presented under code 3178. The jury highlighted this proposal since it considered that the solutions which were put forward for the different buildings to be rehabilitated as well as the connection between the *Rua da Caramoniña* and the park were very successful. What was however considered inappropriate was the treatment suggested to be given to the outside of the buildings, since the proposal did not include the distinctive renders of the local urban architecture, renders which at the same time shape the exterior composition of the buildings.

PRIZES REGARDING LOT 4 (GUADIX)

FIRST PRIZE worth 12,000€ (WINNING PROPOSAL) is granted to the proposal presented under code 2899, which was found worthy of recognition for the reorganization it suggests of the Plaza Pedro de Mendoza, which gives back the main historic access to the Alcazaba its importance, as well as for how naturally this access is restored by means of constructing a series of platforms at different levels. It was also highlighted for the solution put forward for the residential block, which is in current state of ruin, where the authors of the proposal masterfully put into practice the forms and materials of the tradition of the area of Guadix, with a result which is completely aligned with the identity of this place. However, the jury did note that, in the future, it would be good to modify the design for the suggested hotel to be located in the former seminary, in particular the volume which is placed facing the Alcazaba.

The jury also decided to award honourable mentions to two other proposals which they considered best responded to solving some of the arisen issues.

FIRST HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€ is granted to the proposal presented under code 3206. This proposal was praised especially for the quality of the design put forward for the main access to the Alcazaba. However, it was considered that the fact that it was so attractive could somehow excessively compete with the historic building itself, being overshadowed by this access.



It was also noted that the detail given with regard to the residential block was insufficient too.

SECOND HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€ is granted to the proposal presented under code 3165. The jury highlighted this project because of the solution it gave to the residential block of housing, capturing the essence of the tradition of the area of Guadix. On the other hand, however, the design suggested for the access to the Alcazaba was not considered adequate by the jury.

5. By telematic means at 21:49 on 17 June all the participants registered in the competition for the locations of Alzira and Guadix in the registry of the webpage of the Competition are informed of the codes of each of the award-winning proposals for the aforementioned lots, as well as of the amount each one of them has been awarded with.

6. By telematic means at 22.40 on 18 June all the participants registered in the competition for the locations of Santa Cruz de la Palma and Santiago de Compostela in the registry of the webpage of the Competition are informed of the codes of each of the award-winning proposals for the aforementioned lots, as well as of the amount each one of them has been awarded with.

7. Once the aforementioned information is transmitted to the participants, and according to point 15.3 of the terms and conditions of the Competition, the secretary of the Jury proceeds at 21:52 on 17th and at 22:48 on 18th to request the download of the data base of the web page of the Competition to access the personal information linked to the codes of each of the winning proposals to abandon their anonymity. The identity of each and every one of the winning participants is the following:

LOT 1 (ALZIRA)

FIRST PRIZE worth 12,000€ (WINNING PROPOSAL): granted to the proposal presented under code 3156, corresponding to the team made up by Abelardo Linares del Castillo-Valero and Elena Jiménez Sánchez, with their collaborator Paloma Márquez Aguilar.

FIRST HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€: granted to the proposal presented under code 2879, corresponding to the team made up by Alejandro Martínez del Río and Francisco Javier Gómez Patrocinio.

SECOND HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€: granted to the proposal presented under code 2875, corresponding to the team made up by Víctor Manuel Guimerá Millán and María del Pilar Rama Lara.

LOT 2 (SANTA CRUZ DE LA PALMA)

FIRST PRIZE: Not Awarded

FIRST HONOURABLE MENTION *EX AEQUO (I)*, worth 2,000€: granted to the proposal presented under code 2921, corresponding to the team made up by Javier de Mingo García and Carmen Bueno García, with the collaborator Nuria González Roche.

FIRST HONOURABLE MENTION *EX AEQUO (II)*, worth 2,000€: granted to the proposal



presented under code 2989, corresponding to the team made up by Richard Sammons, with the collaborators Anne Fairfax, Phaedra Philippoussis and Cecilia Debary McCammon.

SECOND HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€: granted to the proposal presented under code 2993, corresponding to the team made up by Sergio Hernández Betancor, Carlos Hernández Allende, Marina Valero Martínez and Pedro Guillermo González Gutiérrez.

THIRD HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€: granted to the proposal presented under code 3158, corresponding to the team made up by Jordi Morros Cardona and Jordi Giral García, with their collaborators Javier Monte Collado, Antonio Fumadó Abad, Eduardo Pérez Ramírez and Mireia Fargas Carbonés.

LOT 3 (SANTIAGO DE COMPOSTELA)

FIRST PRIZE worth 12,000€ (WINNING PROPOSAL): granted to the proposal presented under code 2877, corresponding to the team made up by Eva Niño Mendizábal, Elia San Román Vázquez and Carmen Carral Pérez.

FIRST HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€: granted to the proposal presented under code 3238, corresponding to the team made up by Aurora Armental Ruiz and Stefano Ciurlo Walker, with their collaborators María Esther Bergua Orduna, Alejandro Morales Martín, Johanna Hemberger and Ana María Vidal Ruiz de Velasco.

SECOND HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€: granted to the proposal presented under code 2876, corresponding to the team made up by Víctor Manuel Guimerá Millán and María del Pilar Rama Lara.

THIRD HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2,000€: granted to the proposal presented under code 3178, corresponding to the team made up by Ignacio Enrique Galán Fernández and Marina Carlota Álvarez García.

LOT 4 (GUADIX)

FIRST PRIZE worth 12.000€ (WINNING PROPOSAL): granted to the proposal presented under code 2899, corresponding to the team made up by Alfonso Zavala Cendra and Ramón Andrada González-Parrado, with their collaborators José María Fernández Amor and Álvaro Romero Sancho

FIRST HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2000€: granted to the proposal presented under code 3206, corresponding to the team made up by Elena Jiménez Sánchez and Abelardo Linares del Castillo-Valero, with their collaborators Paloma Márquez Aguilar and David Vera García.

SECOND HONOURABLE MENTION worth 2000€: granted to the proposal presented under code 3165, corresponding to the team made up by Laura Elvira Tejedor, Aitor Ramírez Rico and Amaia Prat Aizpuru.



8. The Secretary of the jury reads out point 9.1 of the terms and conditions of the Competition which establishes that: In each one of the lots, the contestant who has obtained the First prize is given the right to opt for contract award of the development of the architecture project and the health and safety project, as well as, if it is the case, the direction of the works, with the only condition of guaranteeing technical and human means according to the nature of the commission as well as as many other complementary technical projects as could be necessary to obtain the necessary licences and authorizations. To carry out the contract of the winning proposal of each lot, the contracting body will have the faculty to establish a negotiation procedure, with no advertisement, and with no concurrence, directly negotiating with the winner (First prize) as established in point 168 et seq. of the LCSP, regarding the economic and technical aspects which will be the object of negotiation between the contracting parties.

9. The administrative documentation presented by the winning proposals will be examined and it will be determined if any documentation has errors which must be corrected, proceeding to establish the appropriate requirements if that is the case.

10. After, the administrative personnel will be in charge of downloading the personal information linked to the codes of each and every one of the non-winning proposals to identify them in order to be able to send notifications –if necessary- to the contestants which have not received a prize, noting those who have expressed their desire to remain anonymous. A list will be elaborated and remained in custody of the Secretary without making the contractor's profile public.

11. The Jury agrees to forward the scores (and the reasons which have led to them) of each of the evaluated proposals to the Procurement Service, being these at the participants disposal so they are able to check and go over their own score and the ones of the winning proposals. The Jury agrees to forward this memorandum with the aim of continuing with the procurement procedure in order to grant the winners with their prize.

At 23:00h 18 June 2020, the President of the Jury considers the act of which this memorandum may be considered as a true reflection, finalised. This memorandum has been drafted in accordance with article 81.3 of R.D. 1098/2001, which approves the General Regulations regarding the Public Administrations Contract Law, with the signature of both the President and the Secretary of the Jury, where and when aforementioned.

This memorandum has been translated into English from its original version in Spanish.